

Acutely Lethal Levels of Cadmium, Copper, and Zinc to Adult Male Coho Salmon and Steelhead

GARY A. CHAPMAN AND DONALD G. STEVENS

*Corvallis Environmental Research Laboratory, Western Fish Toxicology Station
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Corvallis, Oregon 97330*

ABSTRACT

Flow-through acute toxicity tests of cadmium, copper, and zinc were conducted with adult male coho salmon (*Oncorhynchus kisutch*) and adult male steelhead (*Salmo gairdneri*). The 96-h LC50 values for copper were 46 and 57 $\mu\text{g/liter}$, and for zinc were 905 and 1,755 $\mu\text{g/liter}$, for coho salmon and steelhead, respectively. Mortality induced by cadmium was slow in onset, but 50% mortality occurred after more than a week at 3.7 $\mu\text{g/liter}$ for coho salmon and 5.2 $\mu\text{g/liter}$ for steelhead. Hardness and alkalinity of the water supply were higher during the toxicity tests with steelhead, complicating direct comparisons between the two species.

Anadromous salmonids return from the ocean as maturing adults in a state of progressive physical and physiological debilitation, manifested in fungal infections, skin lesions, organ atrophy, and cardiovascular changes. Debilitation is generally more severe in the Pacific salmon (*Oncorhynchus* spp.) which all die after spawning, than in the trout (*Salmo* spp.) which can return to the ocean (Robertson and Wexler 1960; Moore et al. 1976). The deteriorated state of adult salmonids could reduce their resistance to biological, physical, and chemical stresses. Juvenile salmonids represent one of the more pollution-sensitive forms of aquatic life for which toxicity data are available, and mature adult salmonids, because of their debilitation, may be even more sensitive to pollutants.

Few, if any, toxicity tests had been conducted on adult anadromous salmonids prior to this study because of their large size and the inherent problems of collecting and holding them. However, development of an adult salmon testing facility at the Western Fish Toxicology Station (WFTS) made such research practical, and led to this series of toxicity tests to determine the acute lethality of cadmium, copper, and zinc to adult salmonids.

METHODS

Coho salmon (*Oncorhynchus kisutch*) and steelhead (*Salmo gairdneri*), collected from hatchery holding facilities at the termini of their spawning migrations on the Alsea River in western Oregon, were transported in

a refrigerated fish transport truck 32-64 km to the WFTS facility. Only male fish were used because females were required for hatchery spawning. Individual fish were captured, transferred to and from the truck, and distributed among test tanks in a smooth fabric brail to minimize netting injury. Fish were distributed among five identical 5,250-liter holding tanks (Chapman 1978a, this issue) by stratified random assignment.

Depending on the number of fish available, from 50 to 165 adult male coho salmon or steelhead were distributed among the five tanks. After allowing the fish up to 3 days for tank acclimation and recovery from transport and handling, four tanks were dosed with adequate metal stock solution to achieve the nominal concentration, and the stock solution flows were started. The fifth tank served as a control. Stock solution and water flow rates and turnover rates were identical to those previously used for adult salmon (Chapman 1978a, this issue).

Water for the tests was from a shallow (12 m) well on the bank of the Willamette River. Fluctuations in ambient temperature, hardness, and alkalinity occurred during the series of tests, but these fluctuations were merely recorded, and no control was attempted. Dilution water and stock solution flow rates were measured daily, and water temperature in each tank was recorded continuously. Metal stock solutions were prepared from reagent grade chloride salts ($\text{CdCl}_2 \cdot 2.5\text{H}_2\text{O}$; $\text{CuCl}_2 \cdot 2\text{H}_2\text{O}$; and ZnCl_2) dissolved in well water and dispensed from

TABLE 1.—Summary of basic data for toxicity tests of cadmium, copper, and zinc with adult male coho salmon and steelhead. Water chemistry data include range (in parentheses) and mean \pm standard deviation.

Species	Metal	Time (h)	LC50 and 95% confidence limits ^a (μ g/liter)	Dissolved oxygen (mg/liter)	pH	Total hardness CaCO ₃ (mg/liter)	Total alkalinity CaCO ₃ (mg/liter)	Temp. (C)	No. fish per tank	Acclimation time (days)
Coho salmon	Zn	96	905 (636–1,211)	9.8 \pm 0.2 (9.5–10.0)	7.40 \pm 0.28 (7.2–7.6)	25 \pm 2 (23–26)	20 \pm 7 (15–25)	13.7 (10.3–16.5)	10	0
Coho salmon	Cu	96	46 (44–49)	9.9 \pm 0.2 (9.4–10.7)	7.29 \pm 0.09 (7.2–7.4)	20 \pm 1 (19–21)	22 \pm 1 (21–22)	9.4 (8.7–11.1)	33	1
Coho salmon	Cd	215	3.7 (2.6–5.0)	9.8 \pm 0.4 (9.0–10.4)	7.3 \pm 0.04 (7.3)	22 \pm 1 (20–23)	22 \pm 1 (22–23)	10.0 (8.9–10.8)	20	1
Steelhead	Zn	96	1,755 ^b (1,499–16,731)	10.4 (10.0–11.0)	7.45 \pm 0.04 (7.4–7.5)	83 \pm 8 (64–89)	55 \pm 4 (45–59)	10.3 (7.6–12.4)	11	3
Steelhead	Cu	96	57 ^c (46–68)	11.4 (10.6–12.0)	7.57 \pm 0.06 (7.5–7.6)	42 \pm 12 (28–59)	34 \pm 8 (24–45)	9.2 (7.0–11.0)	11	2
Steelhead	Cd	408	5.2 ^d (2.8–8.5)	10.7 (9.7–11.3)	7.50 \pm 0.10 (7.4–7.6)	54 \pm 6 (28–90)	39 \pm 10 (25–62)	9.6 (6.9–11.5)	12	3

^a Moving average method.

^b 735 μ g/liter when adjusted to a hardness of 20 mg/liter (after Brown 1968).

^c 35 μ g/liter when adjusted to a hardness of 20 mg/liter.

^d 1.3 μ g/liter when adjusted to a hardness of 20 mg/liter.

100-liter plastic containers. Typical water quality data for the well water are listed elsewhere (Chapman 1978b, this issue; Samuelson 1976).

Fish were routinely checked every few hours during daylight, and dead fish were removed when noticed. Estimations of LC50 values (concentrations causing 50% mortality in a specified time) were obtained from a computer program for probit (maximum likelihood) and moving-average LC50 computations. Results from both methods agreed within 2%. Abbott's formula (Finney 1971) was used where mortality of control fish occurred.

Daily water samples from each test tank were analyzed for dissolved oxygen using the full-bottle, azide-modified Winkler method (USEPA 1974). The pH, total hardness, and total alkalinity were determined daily on water samples from one tank, and each tank was sampled at least weekly. The pH was measured with a Beckman model 553 pH meter.¹ Total alkalinity was measured by the EDTA titrimetric method, and total hardness was determined potentiometrically (APHA et al. 1971).

Daily water samples from each tank were

¹ Mention of product does not constitute endorsement by EPA.

analyzed for the test metal with a Perkin-Elmer model 403 atomic absorption spectrophotometer. All metal samples were acidified at a rate of 25 ml concentrated nitric acid per liter of sample. Zinc samples were analyzed directly, while cadmium and copper samples were concentrated 20-fold by an evaporation procedure that yielded cadmium recoveries of 101 \pm 3% and copper recoveries of 100 \pm 8% (mean \pm SD). Correction factors were required for cadmium analysis to adjust for matrix effects caused by the concentrated salts. Precision of the cadmium, copper, and zinc analyses were \pm 0.2, \pm 0.4, and \pm 3 μ g/liter, respectively. During the copper toxicity test with coho salmon, no metal analyses were performed, but flow rates of copper stock solution and dilution water were checked daily and were always within \pm 5% of nominal.

Mean weight of coho salmon was about 2.7 kg (steelhead were slightly larger but were not weighed) so that loading factors for 10 and 33 fish per tank were about 5 and 17 g/liter, respectively. However, dynamic loading factors were 1.0 and 3.3 g/liter/day based on replacement flow, and 0.1 and 0.4 g/liter/day based on replacement plus recycle flows. Recommended maximum loading levels for flow-through toxicity tests are 20 g/liter and 2 g/liter/day (Committee on Meth-

ods for Toxicity Tests with Fish (National Academy of Sciences 1975). No food was fed to the adult salmonids do not feed in fresh water.

During the cadmium toxicity test with steelhead the well pump was used for a 65-h period beginning at 0800 h and concluding at 1620 h. The well pump and recycle systems maintained dissolved oxygen and current in the test tanks throughout the period, but no renewal of water was possible.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Acute toxicity and water quality data for the adult coho salmon tests are listed in Table 1. Dissolved oxygen and hardness values remained constant throughout all three coho salmon tests, but water temperatures were higher (mean 13.7 C) during the zinc test than during the cadmium and copper tests (mean, 9.4 and 10.0 C, respectively). During the cadmium and copper toxicity tests, mortality was not observed after 96 h exposure, but it was continued through 215 h for cadmium. The LC50 values for copper were 46 μ g/liter and 915 μ g/liter, respectively, for the 215-h LC50 for cadmium was 3.7 μ g/liter. The two highest cadmium concentrations (15.6 and 8.7 μ g/liter) resulted in identical time-mortality relationships, suggesting a plateauing of the mortality curve such as reported by Finney (1967).

The naturally declining dissolved oxygen test fish resulted in 15% mortality for coho salmon in the copper and cadmium tests. No mortality of control fish was observed in the other four tests.

Toxicity and water quality data for the steelhead tests are also presented in Table 1. The general chemistry of the water varied appreciably from that used in these tests, and as a result, the pH and alkalinity varied widely among toxicity tests. Since pH varies inversely with these parameters, this fluctuation undoubtedly contributed to irregularity in mortality results. The LC50 for zinc was 1,755 μ g/liter.

c with adult male coho
mean \pm standard deviation

Temp. (C)	No. fish per tank	Acclimation time (days)
13.7 (10.3–16.5)	10	0
9.4 (8.7–11.1)	33	1
10.0 (8.9–10.8)	20	1
10.3 (7.6–12.4)	11	3
9.2 (7.0–11.0)	11	2
9.6 (6.9–11.5)	12	3

metal with a Perkin-Elmer absorption spectrophotometer. Samples were acidified with concentrated nitric acid. Zinc samples were analyzed by atomic absorption spectrophotometry. Cadmium and copper samples were analyzed by electrothermal atomic absorption spectrophotometry. Precision of the analyses was $\pm 3\%$ and copper recoveries were 90–100%. Corrections for matrix effects caused by the acid were made. Precision of the zinc analyses were $\pm 3\%$ and recoveries were 90–100%. Toxicity tests with coho salmon were performed, and the stock solution and the test solution were checked daily and were found to be nominal.

Coho salmon was about 100 g and slightly larger but the loading factors for the tests were about 5 and 10 g. However, dynamic loading was 0.0 and 3.3 g/liter/day flow, and 0.1 and 0.4 g/liter/day placement plus recycled maximum loading for the toxicity tests are 20 g/liter (Committee on Meth-

ods for Toxicity Tests with Aquatic Organisms 1975). No food was provided because adult salmonids do not feed once they reenter fresh water.

During the cadmium toxicity test with steelhead the well pump was inoperable for a 65-h period beginning at 97 h exposure and concluding at 162 h exposure. Water recycle systems maintained the dissolved oxygen and current in the tanks during this period, but no renewal of water or cadmium was possible.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Acute toxicity and water quality data for the adult coho salmon tests are summarized in Table 1. Dissolved oxygen, pH, alkalinity, and hardness values remained generally stable throughout all three coho salmon tests, but water temperatures were appreciably higher (mean 13.7 C) during the copper tests than during the cadmium and zinc tests (mean, 9.4 and 10.0 C, respectively). Zinc and copper toxicity tests were terminated after 96 h exposure, but the cadmium test was continued through 215 h because little mortality had occurred by 96 h. The 96-h LC50 values for copper and zinc were 46 $\mu\text{g/liter}$ and 915 $\mu\text{g/liter}$, respectively, while the 215-h LC50 for cadmium was 3.7 $\mu\text{g/liter}$. The two highest cadmium concentrations (15.6 and 8.7 $\mu\text{g/liter}$) produced nearly identical time-mortality relationships suggesting a plateauing of the concentration-mortality curve such as reported by Ball (1967).

The naturally declining condition of the test fish resulted in 15% mortality of coho salmon in the copper and cadmium toxicity tests. No mortality of control fish occurred in the other four tests.

Toxicity and water quality data from the steelhead tests are also presented in Table 1. The general chemistry of the water supply varied appreciably from day to day during these tests, and as a result, the hardness and alkalinity varied widely within and among toxicity tests. Since metal toxicity varies inversely with these two parameters, this fluctuation undoubtedly caused some irregularity in mortality rates. The 96-h LC50 for zinc was 1,755 $\mu\text{g/liter}$; the hard-

ness and alkalinity during this toxicity test were the highest of any of the six tests.

The 96-h LC50 for adult steelhead and copper was 57 $\mu\text{g/liter}$. The mortality curves for steelhead were similar to those for coho salmon in that mortality ceased totally prior to the termination of the 96-h toxicity test. Mortality patterns in acute toxicity tests with copper and adult salmonids typically showed an abrupt decrease in deaths after about 72 h exposure. The cessation of mortality occurred later in the test with steelhead than in the test with coho salmon, and this effect may have been a reflection of the different hardness and alkalinity levels.

During the cadmium toxicity test with adult steelhead, no mortality occurred during the first 200 h of exposure. However, by the termination of the test at 408 h, the LC50 was 5.2 $\mu\text{g/liter}$. The long period prior to the onset of mortality was perhaps due to the greater hardness and alkalinity, but the 65-h period when the test was essentially a circulating static test may also have contributed to the delay.

The fluctuating hardness and alkalinity which occurred during the adult steelhead tests complicated comparisons between these mortality data and those from the adult coho salmon tests conducted in softer water. However, the adult steelhead 96-h LC50 values can be adjusted to a hardness of 20 mg/liter, using the hardness-mortality relationship obtainable from the data of Brown (1968). The relationship between hardness and copper 48-h LC50 data for rainbow trout (Brown 1968) has been confirmed by Chapman and McCrady (1977) who obtained a nearly identical slope for the hardness-copper toxicity relationship for juvenile chinook salmon (*Oncorhynchus tshawytscha*). Moreover, they found the relationship to hold for both 48-h and 96-h LC50 data and for alkalinity as well as hardness. Thus the hardness-metal toxicity relationships of Brown may reasonably represent a valid means for adjusting acute toxicity data for copper, and perhaps other metals, for salmonids in water with low concentrations of metal-complexing organic compounds (such as WFTS well water). With this hardness adjustment made, direct comparison of the data indicated that adult

steelhead were slightly more susceptible to the metals than were adult coho salmon (Table 1).

In order to determine the relative metal sensitivity of adult male and juvenile steelhead, the LC50 data from the adult steelhead toxicity tests were compared to similar LC50 data from toxicity tests with juvenile steelhead which were also conducted at this laboratory (Chapman 1978b, this issue). In all cases these comparisons showed that the adult steelhead had higher LC50 values than the juveniles. Comparison of the acute toxicity data for adult male coho salmon with comparable data for juvenile coho salmon (Chapman, unpublished data) indicated that the adult fish had similar or higher LC50 values than juveniles. These results indicate that the declining condition of adult male fish does not cause them to be more susceptible to the acute lethal effects of metals than are juveniles.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The assistance of Donald Samuelson in conducting the chemical analyses for this study is gratefully acknowledged. Charles Stephen of the Duluth Environmental Research Laboratory provided the LC50 analysis of the mortality data. Fish were obtained and transported through the courtesy of the Oregon Fish Commission and the Oregon State Wildlife Commission.

REFERENCES

APHA (AMERICAN PUBLIC HEALTH ASSOCIATION), AMERICAN WATER WORKS ASSOCIATION, AND

- WATER POLLUTION CONTROL FEDERATION. 1971. Standard methods for the examination of water and wastewater. 13th ed. American Public Health Assoc., New York. 874 pp.
- BALL, I. R. 1967. The toxicity of cadmium to rainbow trout (*Salmo gairdneri* Richardson). Water Res. 1:805-806.
- BROWN, V. M. 1968. The calculation of the acute toxicity of mixtures of poisons to rainbow trout. Water Res. 2:723-733.
- CHAPMAN, G. A. 1978a. Effects of continuous zinc exposure on sockeye salmon during adult-to-smolt fresh water residency. Trans. Am. Fish. Soc. 107:828-836.
- . 1978b. Toxicities of cadmium, copper, and zinc to four juvenile stages of chinook salmon and steelhead. Trans. Am. Fish. Soc. 107:841-847.
- , AND J. K. MCCRADY. 1977. Copper toxicity: a question of form. Pages 132-151 in R. A. Tubb, ed. Recent advances in fish toxicology—a symposium. Ecol. Res. Ser. EPA-600/3-77-085. U.S. Environ. Prot. Agency, Corvallis, Oreg.
- COMMITTEE ON METHODS FOR TOXICITY TESTS WITH AQUATIC ORGANISMS. 1975. Methods for acute toxicity tests with fish, macroinvertebrates, and amphibians. Ecol. Res. Ser. EPA-660/2-75-009. U.S. Environ. Prot. Agency, Corvallis, Oreg. 61 pp.
- FINNEY, D. J. 1971. Probit analysis, 3rd ed. Cambridge Univ. Press.
- MOORE, J. F., W. MAYR, AND C. HOUGIE. 1976. Number, location, and severity of coronary arterial changes in spawning Pacific salmon (*Oncorhynchus*). J. Comp. Pathol. 86:37-43.
- ROBERTSON, O. H., AND B. C. WEXLER. 1960. Histological changes in the organs and tissues of migrating and spawning Pacific salmon (genus *Oncorhynchus*). J. Endocrinol. 66:222-239.
- SAMUELSON, D. F. 1976. Water quality: Western Fish Toxicology Station and Western Oregon Rivers. Ecol. Res. Ser. EPA-600/3-76-077, U.S. Environ. Prot. Agency, Duluth, Minn. 56 pp.
- USEPA (UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY). 1974. Methods of chemical analysis of water and wastes. U.S. Environ. Prot. Agency, Office of Technology Transfer, Washington, D.C. 298 pp.

Toxicities of Stag

Corvallis En
U.S.

Continuous-flow to hatched alevins, swim and steelhead (*Salmo*). more tolerant to cadmium the later progression increase in metal tolerance $\mu\text{g Cd/liter}$, 17 to 38 sensitive to these metals tests with metals is so tolerance may increase similar results.

Juvenile anadromous fresh water for up to 2 gration to the sea, and water residency pass through biologically and morphological stages. The relative resistance of these stages to any potential important consideration application of toxicity data toxicity tests with salmonid parr stage juveniles, provide their general availability size. Only a few acute tests have been reported with em smolts, although chronic tests include most of these stages. This study was conducted the relative toxicities of cadmium and zinc to various juvenile coho salmon (*Oncorhynchus kisutch*) and steelhead (*Salmo gairdneri*).

METHODS

There is no standard procedure for various salmonid life stages. Several have been proposed (USEPA 1975; Snyder 1976). The methodology used here is essentially that of Norman (1947). The life stages compared in the following tests were newly hatched alevins, 5- to 8-mo-old parr, and juvenile steelhead. In brevity these life stages

ic with adult male coho
mean \pm standard devia-

y	Temp. (C)	No. fish per tank	Accli- mation time (days)
	13.7 (10.3-16.5)	10	0
	9.4 (8.7-11.1)	33	1
	10.0 (8.9-10.8)	20	1
	10.3 (7.6-12.4)	11	3
	9.2 (7.0-11.0)	11	2
	9.6 (6.9-11.5)	12	3

metal with a Perkin-
c absorption spectro-
samples were acidi-
l concentrated nitric
e. Zinc samples were
e cadmium and cop-
centrated 20-fold by
ure that yielded cad-
1 \pm 3% and copper
% (mean \pm SD). Cor-
quired for cadmium
matrix effects caused
alts. Precision of the
l zinc analyses were
 $\mu\text{g/liter}$, respectively.
xicity test with coho
yses were performed,
er stock solution and
ecked daily and were
nominal.

o salmon was about
e slightly larger but
at loading factors for
nk were about 5 and
v. However, dynamic
.0 and 3.3 g/liter/day
flow, and 0.1 and 0.4
placement plus recy-
led maximum loading
i toxicity tests are 20
(Committee on Meth-

ods for Toxicity Tests with Aquatic Organ-
isms 1975). No food was provided because
adult salmonids do not feed once they reen-
ter fresh water.

During the cadmium toxicity test with
steelhead the well pump was inoperable for
a 65-h period beginning at 97 h exposure
and concluding at 162 h exposure. Water
recycle systems maintained the dissolved
oxygen and current in the tanks during this
period, but no renewal of water or cadmium
was possible.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Acute toxicity and water quality data for
the adult coho salmon tests are summarized
in Table 1. Dissolved oxygen, pH, alkalinity,
and hardness values remained generally sta-
ble throughout all three coho salmon tests,
but water temperatures were appreciably
higher (mean 13.7 C) during the copper tests
(mean, 9.4 and 10.0 C, respectively). Zinc
and copper toxicity tests were terminated
after 96 h exposure, but the cadmium test
was continued through 215 h because little
mortality had occurred by 96 h. The 96-h
LC50 values for copper and zinc were 46
 $\mu\text{g/liter}$ and 915 $\mu\text{g/liter}$, respectively, while
the 215-h LC50 for cadmium was 3.7 $\mu\text{g/liter}$.
The two highest cadmium concentra-
tions (15.6 and 8.7 $\mu\text{g/liter}$) produced nearly
identical time-mortality relationships sug-
gesting a plateauing of the concentration-
mortality curve such as reported by Ball
(1967).

The naturally declining condition of the
test fish resulted in 15% mortality of coho
salmon in the copper and cadmium toxicity
tests. No mortality of control fish occurred
in the other four tests.

Toxicity and water quality data from the
steelhead tests are also presented in Table
1. The general chemistry of the water sup-
ply varied appreciably from day to day dur-
ing these tests, and as a result, the hardness
and alkalinity varied widely within and
among toxicity tests. Since metal toxicity
varies inversely with these two parameters,
this fluctuation undoubtedly caused some
irregularity in mortality rates. The 96-h
LC50 for zinc was 1,755 $\mu\text{g/liter}$; the hard-

ness and alkalinity during this toxicity test
were the highest of any of the six tests.

The 96-h LC50 for adult steelhead and
copper was 57 $\mu\text{g/liter}$. The mortality curves
for steelhead were similar to those for coho
salmon in that mortality ceased totally prior
to the termination of the 96-h toxicity test.
Mortality patterns in acute toxicity tests
with copper and adult salmonids typically
showed an abrupt decrease in deaths after
about 72 h exposure. The cessation of mor-
tality occurred later in the test with steel-
head than in the test with coho salmon, and
this effect may have been a reflection of the
different hardness and alkalinity levels.

During the cadmium toxicity test with
adult steelhead, no mortality occurred dur-
ing the first 200 h of exposure. However, by
the termination of the test at 408 h, the
LC50 was 5.2 $\mu\text{g/liter}$. The long period prior
to the onset of mortality was perhaps due to
the greater hardness and alkalinity, but the
65-h period when the test was essentially a
circulating static test may also have contrib-
uted to the delay.

The fluctuating hardness and alkalinity
which occurred during the adult steelhead
tests complicated comparisons between
these mortality data and those from the
adult coho salmon tests conducted in softer
water. However, the adult steelhead 96-h
LC50 values can be adjusted to a hardness
of 20 mg/liter, using the hardness-mortality
relationship obtainable from the data of
Brown (1968). The relationship between
hardness and copper 48-h LC50 data for
rainbow trout (Brown 1968) has been con-
firmed by Chapman and McCrady (1977)
who obtained a nearly identical slope for the
hardness-copper toxicity relationship for
juvenile chinook salmon (*Oncorhynchus*
tshawytscha). Moreover, they found the re-
lationship to hold for both 48-h and 96-h
LC50 data and for alkalinity as well as hard-
ness. Thus the hardness-metal toxicity re-
lationships of Brown may reasonably rep-
resent a valid means for adjusting acute
toxicity data for copper, and perhaps other
metals, for salmonids in water with low con-
centrations of metal-complexing organic
compounds (such as WFTS well water).
With this hardness adjustment made, direct
comparison of the data indicated that adult

